

APPENDIX: Scores of subnational areas in Latin America on indicators of FoRB datasets

This appendix scores some subnational areas in Latin American countries on a selection of indicators of the analyzed FoRB datasets applying their own methodologies to the local level. Please note this is not an exhaustive sample. Please also note that the data presented here is subject to standard data collection issues. The main purpose of this appendix is to illustrate the existence of subnational variation that is not detected by FoRB datasets.

Subnational finding 1 (Mexico): Notwithstanding the general hostility toward religion and the strict separation of church and state at the federal level, there is a widespread perception that Catholic ministers exert an influence on policy at the state and local level. We did not find much empirical evidence for this claim, but if true, it would alter the scores of variables that describe government interference in and support of religion.

Variable	FoRB dataset	Scale	Mexico	Subnational score
GRI.Q.4 Does any level of government interfere with worship or other religious practices?	Pew 2019	0-1	0.67	0.67
sbx: official support	RAS 2014	13-category typology	Separationist: Official separation of Church and state and the state is slightly hostile toward religion. This includes efforts to remove expression of religion by private citizens from the public sphere.	Multi-Tiered Preferences 1: one religion is clearly preferred by state, receiving the most benefits, there exists one or more tiers of religions which receive less benefits than the preferred religion but more than some other religions.

Subnational finding 2 (Mexico): Based on personal observations and interviews, we conclude it is a common practice for the state and municipal chapters of political parties to channel public funds to religious organizations (mainly Catholic and Protestant denominations) in exchange for electoral support. Whilst technically the state is not providing any funding to religious groups, it does so indirectly through the political parties is subsidizes.

Variable	FoRB dataset	Scale	Mexico	Subnational score
GRI.Q. 20 Do some religious groups receive government support or favors, such as funding, official recognition or special access?	Pew 2019	0-1 + 1/5 point if the country's constitution or basic law recognizes a favored religion or religions; <u>one or more religious groups have privileges or government access unavailable to other religious groups; the government provides funds or other resources to one or more religious groups</u> ; religious education is required in public schools by local governments or the national government; <u>the national government defers in some way to religious authorities, texts or doctrines on legal issues</u>	0.12	0.60

Variable	FoRB dataset	Scale	Mexico	Subnational score
lx33: Direct general grants to religious organizations.	RAS 2014	0-1	0	1

Subnational finding 3 (Mexico, Colombia, Venezuela): There is evidence of religious intolerance in rural indigenous communities in the south of Mexico. This phenomenon is comprehensively recognized in the IRF reports by the US State Department and other sources. Unlike the situation in indigenous territories in other countries of Latin America (including Colombia and Venezuela), this is adequately reflected in Mexico's score on Pew's Social Hostilities Index.

Variable	FoRB dataset	Scale	Colombia	Mexico	Venezuela
Social Hostilities Index	Pew 2019	0-10	2.6	4.5	1.6

Subnational finding 4 (Colombia): The indigenous territories of Colombia have far-reaching self-government rights, allowing them to implement their own policies in a wide variety of fields, including religious policy. Fieldwork conducted between 2010 and 2016 among the Nasa ethnic group in the *resguardos indígenas* of the southwestern highlands of Colombia revealed that this legal system allows the existence of severe violations of religious freedom, such as aggression as a result of conversion, violent assaults against attenders of religious services, restrictions of faith-based education and bans on proselytism.

Regulation of and Restrictions on the Majority Religion or All Religions (RAS 2014)	Variable	Colombia	Nasa indigenous community (Colombia) 2010-2016
Restrictions on religious political parties.	NX01X2014	0	3
Restrictions on trade associations or other civil associations being affiliated with religion.	NX02X2014	0	3
Restrictions on clergy holding political office.	NX03X2014	0	3
Restrictions or monitoring of sermons by clergy. (this generally applies to political speech)	NX04X2014	0	2
Restrictions on clergy/religious organizations engaging in public political speech (other than sermons) or propaganda or on political activity in or by religious institutions.	NX05X2014	0	2
Restrictions/harassment of members and organizations of the majority religion who operate outside of the state sponsored or recognized ecclesiastical framework (do not code arrests for activities that are commonly considered criminal unless these charges seem to be pretexts).	NX06X2014	0	2
Restrictions on formal religious organizations other than political parties	NX07X2014	0	1
Restrictions on access to places of worship.	NX08X2014	0	2
Foreign religious organizations are required to have a local sponsor or affiliation	NX09X2014	0	0
Heads of religious organizations (eg. Bishops) must be citizens of the state.	NX10X2014	0	3
All practicing clergy must be citizens of the state.	NX11X2014	0	3

Regulation of and Restrictions on the Majority Religion or All Religions (RAS 2014)	Variable	Colombia	Nasa indigenous community (Colombia) 2010-2016
The government appoints (code as 3) or must approve (code as 2) clerical appointments or somehow takes part in the appointment process (code as 1).	NX12X2014	0	1
Other than appointments, the government legislates or otherwise officially influences the internal workings or organization of religious institutions and organizations.	NX13X2014	0	2
Laws governing the state rel. are passed by the government or require the government's approval.	NX14X2014	0	3
Restrictions on the public observance of rel. practices, including rel. holidays and the Sabbath.	NX15X2014	0	2
Restrictions on religious activities outside of recognized religious facilities.	NX16X2014	0	3
Restrictions on the publication or dissemination of written religious material.	NX17X2014	0	0
People are arrested for religious activities.	NX18X2014	0	2
Restrictions on religious public gatherings that are not placed on other types of public gathering.	NX19X2014	0	3
Restrictions on the public display by private persons or orgs. of rel. symbols, including (but not limited to) rel. dress, the presence or absence of facial hair, nativity scenes/icons.	NX20X2014	0	2
Conscientious objectors to military service are not allowed alternative service and are prosecuted.	NX21X2014	0	3
Arrest/detention/ harassment of religious figures, officials, and/or members of religious parties.	NX22X2014	0	2
Restrictions on public religious speech.	NX23X2014	0	3
Restrictions on religious-based hate speech.	NX24X2014	2	0
Government controls/influences the instructors or content of rel. education in public schools.	NX25X2014	0	3
Government controls/influences the instructors or content of rel. education outside public schools.	NX26X2014	0	3
Government controls/influences the instructors or content of rel. education at the university level.	NX27X2014	0	3
State ownership of some religious property or buildings.	NX28X2014	0	3
Other religious restrictions. Specify:	NX29X2014	0	0
Religious Regulation Index	NXX2014	2	62

Subnational finding 5 (Mexico, Colombia, El Salvador, Venezuela): Organized crime threatens the religious freedom of actively practicing believers in territories it controls. In part because of intense lobbying by faith-based organizations, this aspect has increasingly been recognized in the IRF reports by the US State Department on Mexico. However, this is not case for El Salvador, Colombia and Venezuela that are affected by organized crime in similar ways. Moreover, in spite of the recognition of the impact of organized crime on FoRB, it is not reflected in Mexico's score on Pew's Social Hostilities Index, mainly because none of its variables allow to account for the role of organized crime.

Variable	FoRB dataset	Scale	Colombia	Mexico	El Salvador	Venezuela
Social Hostilities Index	Pew 2019	0-10	2.6	4.5	2.7	1.6

Subnational finding 6 (Mexico): In our view, the role of organized crime is more adequately observed by applying government regulation measures at the subnational level because they act as a de facto government in some contexts. Indeed, when drug cartels take over essential functions of the state, as is the case in northeast Mexico, they effectively regulate aspects of religion (in particular: religious observance, places of worship, religious laws, conversion, proselytizing, discriminatory registrations and bans, clerical appointments, religious associations and political speech).

Regulation of and Restrictions on the Majority Religion or All Religions (RAS 2014)	Variable	Mexico	Nuevo León, Tamaulipas, San Luis Potosí (Mexico) 2009-2015
Restrictions on religious political parties.	NX01X2014	3	2
Restrictions on trade associations or other civil associations being affiliated with religion.	NX02X2014	0	2
Restrictions on clergy holding political office.	NX03X2014	3	2
Restrictions or monitoring of sermons by clergy. (this generally applies to political speech)	NX04X2014	3	2
Restrictions on clergy/religious organizations engaging in public political speech (other than sermons) or propaganda or on political activity in or by religious institutions.	NX05X2014	3	2
Restrictions/harassment of members and organizations of the majority religion who operate outside of the state sponsored or recognized ecclesiastical framework (do not code arrests for activities that are commonly considered criminal unless these charges seem to be pretexts).	NX06X2014	1	2
Restrictions on formal religious organizations other than political parties	NX07X2014	0	1
Restrictions on access to places of worship.	NX08X2014	0	1
Foreign religious organizations are required to have a local sponsor or affiliation	NX09X2014	0	0
Heads of religious organizations (eg. Bishops) must be citizens of the state.	NX10X2014	0	0
All practicing clergy must be citizens of the state.	NX11X2014	0	0
The government appoints (code as 3) or must approve (code as 2) clerical appointments or somehow takes part in the appointment process (code as 1).	NX12X2014	0	2
Other than appointments, the government legislates or otherwise officially influences the internal workings or organization of religious institutions and organizations.	NX13X2014	0	1
Laws governing the state rel. are passed by the government or require the government's approval.	NX14X2014	0	0
Restrictions on the public observance of rel. practices, including rel. holidays and the Sabbath.	NX15X2014	0	1

Regulation of and Restrictions on the Majority Religion or All Religions (RAS 2014)	Variable	Mexico	Nuevo León, Tamaulipas, San Luis Potosí (Mexico) 2009-2015
Restrictions on religious activities outside of recognized religious facilities.	NX16X2014	1	1
Restrictions on the publication or dissemination of written religious material.	NX17X2014	0	0
People are arrested for religious activities.	NX18X2014	0	1
Restrictions on religious public gatherings that are not placed on other types of public gathering.	NX19X2014	1	2
Restrictions on the public display by private persons or orgs. of rel. symbols, including (but not limited to) rel. dress, the presence or absence of facial hair, nativity scenes/icons.	NX20X2014	0	0
Conscientious objectors to military service are not allowed alternative service and are prosecuted.	NX21X2014	0	3
Arrest/detention/ harassment of religious figures, officials, and/or members of religious parties.	NX22X2014	0	2
Restrictions on public religious speech.	NX23X2014	0	3
Restrictions on religious-based hate speech.	NX24X2014	0	0
Government controls/influences the instructors or content of rel. education in public schools.	NX25X2014	0	1
Government controls/influences the instructors or content of rel. education outside public schools.	NX26X2014	0	1
Government controls/influences the instructors or content of rel. education at the university level.	NX27X2014	0	1
State ownership of some religious property or buildings.	NX28X2014	2	0
Other religious restrictions. Specify:	NX29X2014	3	0
Religious Regulation Index	NXX2014	20	33

Subnational finding 7 (Cuba): Although Cuba is a unitary state with a high degree of administrative centralization, the intensity of surveillance and administrative restrictions are reportedly higher in the eastern half of the island. That is where communist party officials, according to various interviewees, seem to be more attached to the original antireligious communist practices than their counterparts in the western half of the island.

Variable	FoRB dataset	Scale	Cuba	West-Cuba	East-Cuba
v2clrelig: Is there freedom of religion?	V-Dem 2021	0-1	0.007	Less restrictions	More restrictions
Government Restrictions Index	Pew 2019	0-10	5.3		
Religious Discrimination Against Minority Religions	RAS 2014	0-108	38		
Regulation of and Restrictions on the Majority Religion or All Religions	RAS 2014	0-87	27		